NILL No. 013319

19930420

MNDIAN LAW SUPPORT CENTER

APR 26 1988

Of Counsel: ASHFORD & WRISTON

WAYNE NASSER 1097-0 MICHAEL W. GIBSON 1382-0 Alii Place, 14th Floor 1099 Alakea Street P.O. Box 131 Honolulu, Hawaii 96810 Telephone: (808) 539-0400

Attorneys for Defendants
The Estate of James Campbell, Deceased,
W. H. McVay and P. R. Cassiday,
Trustees Under the Will and of
the Estate of James Campbell, Deceased,
acting in their fiduciary and not in
their individual capacities, Herbert
C. Cornuelle and F.E. Trotter

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE THIRD CIRCUIT

STATE OF HAWAII

)

PELE DEFENSE FUND,

Plaintiff,

v.

WILLIAM PATY, in his capacity as) Chairman of the Board of Land and Natural Resources, State of) Hawaii, MOSES KEALOHA, DOUGLAS ING, LEONARD ZALOPANY, JOHN ARISUMI and HERBERT ARATA, in their capacity as members of the) Board of Land and Natural Resources; The Estate of JAMES CAMPBELL, Deceased, FRED E. TROTTER, W.H. McVAY, P.R. CASSIDAY, and HERBERT C. CORNUELLE, in their fiduciary capacity as Trustees under the Will of James Campbell, Deceased; TRUE ENERGY GEOTHERMAL) CORP., TRUE GEOTHERMAL DRILLING) CO., and MID-PACIFIC GEOTHERMAL) INC.,

CIVIL NO. 89-089 (Hilo) (Declaratory Judgment/ Injunction)

DEFENDANTS THE ESTATE OF JAMES CAMPBELL, DECEASED, W. H. McVAY AND P. R. CASSIDAY, TRUSTEES UNDER THE WILL AND OF THE ESTATE OF JAMES CAMPBELL, DECEASED, ACTING IN THEIR FIDUCIARY AND NOT IN THEIR INDIVIDUAL CAPACITIES, HERBERT C. CORNUELLE AND F.E. TROTTER'S MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO DELETE DEFENDANTS WILLIAM PATY, MOSES KEAHOLA, DOUGLAS ING, LEONARD ZALOPANY, JOHN ARISUMI AND HERBERT ARATA AS NAMED DEFENDANTS FROM THE CAPTION, FILED ON APRIL 6, 1993; CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Defendants.

VI.

Hearing Date: May 7, 1993
(By Telephone Conference)
Hearing Time: 8:00 a.m.
Hearing Judge: The Honorable
Ricki Amano

DEFENDANTS THE ESTATE OF JAMES CAMPBELL, DECEASED, W. H. McVAY AND P. R. CASSIDAY, TRUSTEES UNDER THE WILL AND OF THE ESTATE OF JAMES CAMPBELL, DECEASED, ACTING IN THEIR FIDUCIARY AND NOT IN THEIR INDIVIDUAL CAPACITIES, HERBERT C. CORNUELLE AND F.E. TROTTER'S MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO DELETE DEFENDANTS WILLIAM PATY, MOSES KEAHOLA, DOUGLAS ING, LEONARD ZALOPANY, JOHN ARISUMI AND HERBERT ARATA AS NAMED DEFENDANTS FROM THE CAPTION, FILED ON APRIL 6, 1993

Defendants The Estate of James Campbell, Deceased, W.H.

McVay and P.R. Cassiday, Trustees under the Will and of The

Estate of James Campbell, Deceased, acting in their fiduciary and

not in their individual capacities (hereinafter collectively

referred to as "Defendants Campbell Estate") oppose Plaintiff's

Motion to Delete Defendants William Paty, Moses Keahola, Douglas

Ing, Leonard Zalopany, John Arisumi and Herbert Arata as Named

Defendants from the Caption. Plaintiff's cite no caselaw

authority for deleting defendants' names from the caption in the

Affidavit of Paul F. N. Lucas attached to its Motion.

Moreover, Haw. R. Civ. P. 21 cited by Plaintiff in its

Motion does not pertain to amending a caption. Rule 21 has to do

with the dropping or adding of parties where there is a

"misjoinder" or "non-joinder."

Even assuming that Rule 21 authorizes amendment of the caption, it does not apply in the instant case. Rule 21

specifically deals with the "misjoinder and non-joinder of parties." In this case, the defendants were properly joined but the court lacked jurisdiction over such defendants because of the defense of sovereign immunity and the running of the statute of limitations. See Pele Defense Fund v. Paty, 73 Haw. 578 (1992). As there was no "misjoinder," Rule 21 does not authorize dropping defendants' names from the caption.

Circuit Court Rule 3(c)(4) states that the first page of all papers shall contain "the title of the cause (which title shall include the names of all of the parties in the initial pleading, but thereafter may be appropriately abbreviated.)" In accord with Circuit Court Rule 3(c)(4), defendants' names must remain in the caption.

For the foregoing reasons, Defendants Campbell Estate respectfully request that Plaintiff's Motion to Delete Defendants William Paty, Moses Keahola, Douglas Ing, Leonard Zalopany, John

3

Arisumi and Herbert Arata as Named Defendants from the Caption be denied.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii; April 20, 1993.

WAYNE NASSER

MICHAEL W. GIBSON

Attorneys for Defendants
The Estate of James
Campbell, Deceased, W. H.
McVay and P. R. Cassiday,
Trustees Under the Will and
of the Estate of James
Campbell, Deceased, acting
in their fiduciary and not
in their individual
capacities, Herbert C.
Cornuelle and F.E. Trotter

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE THIRD CIRCUIT

STATE OF HAWAII

PELE DEFENSE FUND,
Plaintiffs,

vs.

WILLIAM PATY, in his capacity as) Chairman of the Board of Land and Natural Resources, State of) Hawaii, MOSES KEALOHA, DOUGLAS ING, LEONARD ZALOPANY, JOHN ARISUMI and HERBERT ARATA, in their capacity as members of the) Board of Land and Natural Resources; The Estate of JAMES CAMPBELL, Deceased, FRED E. TROTTER, W.H. McVAY, P.R. CASSIDAY, and HERBERT C. CORNUELLE, in their fiduciary capacity as Trustees under the Will of James Campbell, Deceased; TRUE ENERGY GEOTHERMAL) CORP., TRUE GEOTHERMAL DRILLING) CO., and MID-PACIFIC GEOTHERMAL) INC.,

CIVIL NO. 89-089 (Hilo) (Declaratory Judgment/ Injunction)

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that on the date set forth below service of a copy of the foregoing document was made upon the parties below, by depositing the same in the United States mail, postage prepaid, addressed as follows:

ALAN T. MURAKAMI, ESQ. PAUL N. LUCAS, ESQ. 1164 Bishop Centre 1164 Bishop Street, Ste. 1205 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Defendants.

STEVEN C. MOORE Native American Rights Fund 1506 Broadway Boulder, Colorado 80302

YUKLIN ALULI, ESQ. 415-C Uluniu Street Kailua, Hawaii 96734

Attorneys for Plaintiff

GARY B.K.T. LEE, ESQ. STEPHANIE A. REZENTS, ESQ. Kendall Building, 8th Floor 888 Mililani Street Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Attorneys for Defendants
True Energy Geothermal Corp., True
Geothermal Drilling Co. and
Mid-Pacific Geothermal Inc.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii; April 21, 1993.

Miceael wo or my

WAYNE NASSER
MICHAEL W. GIBSON
Attorneys for Defendants
The Estate of James
Campbell, Deceased, W. H.
McVay and P. R. Cassiday,
Trustees Under the Will and
of the Estate of James
Campbell, Deceased, acting
in their fiduciary and not
in their individual
capacities, Herbert C.
Cornuelle and F.E. Trotter