

CHAPTER XIV

MISSIONARY ACTIVITIES AMONG THE INDIANS

A Program of Coöperation. If one should attempt to summarize in a single word the outstanding need in the field of missionary activities among the Indians that word would be coöperation. Coöperation is needed both in the relationships between the government and the missionaries and in the relationships between the churches or the missionaries themselves. Positive action looking toward improvement must therefore take the direction of improving the mechanism through which coöperation can be made effective. No mechanism can of itself achieve coöperation, which after all depends on spiritual qualities such as charity, fairmindedness, tolerance, and forbearance and a willingness to ignore minor differences for the sake of achieving great common ends. An adequate mechanism can, however, bring differing groups together to consider the great common ends and can afford the opportunity for personal associations in an effort to solve common problems and can in a measure overcome those differences that are born of misunderstandings and ignorance of the others' point of view. So far as the survey staff can see, the establishment of ways which will facilitate coöperation is the only administrative course that offers any hope of reasonable success.

Between the Government and Churches and Missions. In the chapter on organization and management the recommendation has been made that a scientific and technical division of planning and development be established in the Indian Service. This division would be composed of specialists in the various social and economic fields involved in the administration of Indian affairs. Some of these specialists would be permanent, others temporary. The appropriation for this division should be in a lump sum to permit of the employment of temporary specialists and the payment of the expenses of persons who might be called in as representatives of organizations with which the government must coöperate if it is to achieve large results.

This division, as has been explained at length in the earlier section, would operate on a project basis. That is to say for each particular problem a committee would be appointed consisting of specially selected members of the division and of representatives of those organizations whose coöperation is essential. This committee would then formulate plans and a program to be presented to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs for consideration and if it met with his approval for adoption; or if it involved appropriations or other legislative action, for submission to Congress through the appropriate channels. The development of a constructive social and economic program for each particular reservation would be a more or less distinct project. The programs for several different jurisdictions might well follow the same general pattern, modified to make it fit as closely as possible the individual peculiarities of each jurisdiction.

One of the reasons which led to the recommendation of such a division operating on project basis was that it seemed to the survey staff the most practicable device for affording opportunity for coöperation between the government and other agencies, both religious and secular, whose activities overlap those of the government and whose work must be coördinated with that of the government if all are to operate effectively and with a minimum of friction for a common end. In projects that affect many reservations and are broad in scope, the churches could be represented by members of their larger national boards. In those that are concerned with particular reservations they could, if they preferred, be represented by their local missionaries. In any event one of the duties of the project committee would be to consult and endeavor to tie in all agencies at work in the particular field so that the program as a whole would be well coördinated.

In addition to establishing the Division of Planning and Development and strengthening the government personnel in immediate contact with the Indians, it would seem as if the government might take one further step in providing a mechanism for coöperation between the government and the churches doing Indian mission work and between these churches themselves. A national advisory council composed of representatives of each of the churches engaged in mission work among the Indians would, it is believed,

serve a valuable purpose. To it the government officers might refer for consideration and recommendations those major problems in the administration of Indian affairs that involve missionary activities. Thus the representatives of the churches would get a clearer and more definite understanding of the problems from the standpoint of the responsible government officers. They would be asked, "What would you do if you were in the place of these government officers and had to make the administrative decision?" Faced with these concrete specific problems, such a council might quickly see that a sound decision would be greatly facilitated if the churches themselves by their own action could alter certain of the facts in the case so as to remove some of the difficulties which the government itself is powerless to remove. Such a council would serve too as a clearing house for information. The churches would thus learn more definitely about each other's activities and difficulties and a way might be opened whereby they could supplement each other's work or agree on some consolidation or division of the field so that the present missionary funds could be more effectively utilized. It is therefore recommended that the Secretary of the Interior communicate with the appropriate officers of the various church organizations at present conducting missionary activities among the Indians to ascertain the feasibility of the establishment of an advisory council on coöperation to be composed of representatives of these organizations. If the churches are willing to coöperate in such a council it is recommended that an appropriation be made by the national government to defray the traveling expenses and the subsistence of these representatives when in attendance at council meetings or meetings of committees of the council called at the request of the government.

Among Churches and Missionaries. Because of the great concern which the survey staff has for the Indians, and for the success of work in their behalf, it will perhaps be pardoned if it venture somewhat beyond what is possibly its proper field and offer certain suggestions for the consideration of the churches and the missionaries. This course seems appropriate because the staff has given considerable time to a study of the missionary activities and has profited much from interviews with the missionaries.

Two great advantages are possessed by those who plan missionary enterprises as compared with those who organize the work of the Indian Office. First, the missionary societies are not bound by the great variety of duties inherent in the relationship of the guardian to the ward, and are therefore free to specialize and to render a service of experimentation and demonstration, both for the benefit of the Indians and for the instruction of government officers. Second, the duties of the mission field are performed by persons who have consecrated their lives definitely to this service and who may therefore be depended upon to give a lifetime of devotion to a single piece of work with the Indians in some selected locality, if such a course is necessary to the success of an undertaking. If in addition to these advantages missionaries were more generally qualified by special preparation for definite lines of secular work with the people, Christian missions, both Catholic and Protestant, might render an incomparable service to the nation as well as to the Indians.

The Protestant churches particularly, it would seem, should give more thought to the serious problems arising from the isolation of their missionaries. Many of these missionaries need much greater opportunity for normal friendly human contacts with persons other than those they meet in the regular course of the day's work. In part, this situation could be improved if greater financial support could be given so that the missionary could occasionally afford a vacation and could be required to take one. More frequent visits from members of the home church or directing board would be helpful and stimulating. The situation would be improved, too, if some regular assistants could be supplied so that the missionary and his family would not be the only workers at a station.

Visits from members of boards or from persons maintained by the home church in supervisory capacity are especially needed when evidence indicates that some friction is developing in the jurisdiction. Whatever the merits of the case may be, the local missionary is hardly in a position to deal with the situation himself either by appeal to the superintendent or by going over his head to the Washington office. So long as there is no friction he can, of course, deal either with the local employees or the Washington

office without difficulty, but once real friction has arisen the situation tends to become worse rather than better if he himself tries to take action. The need here is for a representative of the home church or board to visit the field to study the situation as impersonally as possible and then to take such action as seems appropriate. Appeals to the Washington office might properly come through the home church or board after first-hand study rather than from the missionary in the field.

Unless funds are available adequately to maintain all stations at present in operation, the question may be raised as to whether more effective results could not be secured through concentrating the resources on a smaller number of stations. Such a course will doubtless be necessary in several instances if the mission program is to be broadened, utilizing a large number of contacts with the Indians instead of placing the main reliance upon the more or less traditional activities of churches in white communities.

In all this work much sympathetic consideration must be given the native Indian religions and ethics and even the forms of worship. Enough has been said in the main part of this section regarding building on the good in the existing religion and ethics of the Indians. Possibly this course coupled with the utilization of a broader program of activities will materially aid in the development of native leadership and hasten the day when Indian churches are self-supporting and self-propagating.

Regarding coöperation between the churches with respect to matters of doctrine and other strictly religious subjects, little can be offered in the way of constructive recommendations. The need for coöperation in this field must be apparent to anyone who studies the missionary activities among the Indians. Whether councils of representatives of the different denominations could make any progress in an effort to agree on a limited number of very simple essentials in Christian life, separated in so far as possible from doctrinal matters is, of course, open to grave question. Many devout church members and church leaders see this great need and many movements in this direction are under way. They have been given impetus by studies of missionary activities in foreign lands whereas among the Indians the need is for simplicity, unity, and coöperation.

Missions and the Government.¹ Religion is a dominant force in the life of a people. Any study of social conditions that failed to include religious activities would be grossly incomplete. The religious activities carried on by the Christian missionaries are an important part of the impact of a new civilization upon Indian life. They represent the effort to modify or supplant the old Indian religions which have occupied so large a place in the activities and thoughts of the Indians. The Indians were and are a deeply religious people. It may even be said that religion is the mainspring of their whole life and conduct. As Canon George Rawlinson says, "The most important element in the thought of a people, the chief influence by which their character is formed and their inner and even their outer life determined, is their religion." Thus the activities of the Christian missionaries among the Indians represent an effort to bring about so vital and fundamental a change that their work must be considered here.

Many people are deeply interested in these missionary activities, which represent by far the largest and most important privately supported humanitarian effort made by the white race in behalf of the Indians. Churches of many different denominations are contributing to the support of missions to the Indians and their sup-

¹ The activities of the Christian missionaries among the Indians have to a limited extent been referred to and discussed in the earlier chapters of this report insofar as they were found to have an important relationship to the general subjects of these sections. The survey staff endeavored in its field work insofar as possible to visit the missionary activities in the several jurisdictions and to interview the missionaries. No one person on the staff was especially assigned to this work, but all participated in it, each from the point of view of his particular assignment. The members of the staff did not feel that they were authorized to go into the missionary activities in the same detail as they did the government work. They appreciated that they were received at the missions purely as a matter of courtesy and that they ought to depend entirely on this courtesy for the information which they secured. No effort was made, for example, to get data regarding the personnel of the mission establishments such as were secured from the government employees relating to salaries, duties, and qualifications, nor were questionnaire cards distributed generally among pupils in mission schools. It should be said, however, that the members of the staff were received most cordially by the missionaries, and are indebted to them not only for the opportunity to go over their plants in considerable detail but also for the invaluable opportunity to discuss freely with the missionaries the Indian problem from their point of view. In many instances the staff is indebted to the missionaries for delightful, quiet courtesies extended to it.

porters among church members occupy a vitally important position in providing for the welfare of the Indian race. Not only do they provide directly for the maintenance of missionary activities, but it is in no small measure to them that the government must look for support in its efforts to render the Indians the highest type of broad and enlightened educational service and to prevent exploitation and abuse. Church members everywhere would very properly feel that a report of this character was unsatisfactory if it did not include a special section on missions.

The existence of missionary activities in the several Indian jurisdictions gives rise also to many difficult problems in the administration of Indian affairs by the government, and these problems deserve special consideration. Although in actual practice all missionary activities are so closely interwoven as to be practically inseparable, the work of the missionaries may be considered from two aspects. The first is concerned with what may be termed strictly religious or even doctrinal teaching; the second, with secular activities embracing formal schooling, social and economic training, and other philanthropic endeavors which arise from the religion of the missionaries but are not in any large sense doctrinal, although much that is strictly religious may be interwoven with them.

The Government and Religious or Doctrinal Teaching. With the strictly religious teaching, the government, under the American system of complete separation of church and state, cannot be directly concerned. Its administrative problems in this field relate primarily to affording the missionaries opportunities, facilities, and proper coöperation. As will be discussed more at length in subsequent parts of this chapter, these are often difficult and perplexing problems because of the number of different religious denominations involved. The government by itself is powerless to harmonize and coöordinate their activities in the strictly religious field. This problem is for the churches themselves; the government can only pursue the course of strict neutrality.

The Government and Secular Activities of Missionaries. With the activities of the missionaries which relate to secular education, social and economic training, and other philanthropic endeavors, the government is very much concerned because here the functions of the missionaries overlap those which the government itself has

assumed. Coöperation and coordination between the government and the missionaries thus become essential, and the government has not only the right but also a duty to inquire into the nature and efficiency of such work where the missionaries as volunteers are doing that for which the government itself is primarily responsible.

Since, as has been pointed out, the two parts of the missionary work are so closely interwoven as to be practically inseparable, and since the government has properly no concern with the first and a very great and vital concern with the second, the administrative problem of the government in dealing with the missionaries and of the missionaries in dealing with the government is one of extreme complexity and delicacy. The position of the government becomes almost impossible unless the missionaries fully recognize its embarrassments and appreciate the fact that much of their work is not separable from that of the government itself but supplemental to it, and that coöperation with the government to the maximum possible extent is the only effective working arrangement.

In this connection it should be pointed out that the necessity for such coöperation presents to the missionaries, especially to those in the field, no little embarrassment. Some of these embarrassments should be specifically mentioned so that this problem may be more definitely understood.

The work of the missionary requires him to establish close and friendly relations with the Indians in his jurisdiction, and as a result he acquires a vast amount of information. He learns, for example, of certain crimes and misdemeanors committed on the reservation. In some instances the local government superintendent is combating these disorders with every power at his command. Shall the missionary turn over to the superintendent the information which he has secured and join with him in an active campaign for law and order, perhaps thereby jeopardizing his own friendly relations with the Indians and his chance to influence them? On the other hand cases arise in which the judgment of the government superintendent may lead him to avoid direct action against certain offenses, whereas the missionary feels that direct and positive action is the only effective course and that it must be taken by the superintendent if it is to be taken at all.

Through friendship with the Indians the missionary inevitably hears complaints against the private and official acts of the super-

intendent and other government employees or even against the action of the government at Washington. In some instances his firm conviction may be that the action of the officers or of the government itself is clearly wrong. His attempts to deal directly and simply with the superintendent and other local employees may result in disastrous failure and great personal friction. The matter may become generally known about the jurisdiction and the Indians themselves may take sides, thus causing an intolerable situation. Appeal by the missionary directly to the Indian Office at Washington or to the public may remedy the situation or it may make it distinctly worse. The primary cause of the disagreement is difference in point of view and difference in judgment. The weight which various persons attach to the same facts is very different and judgments as to the proper course to pursue also vary widely. Each person from his own point of view is clearly correct.

These difficulties in the way of cooperation are cited primarily to illustrate the great need for it and to make clearer the intricate problem of the relationship of the missionaries to the government. This problem is mentioned here as one of the reasons why a special discussion of missions is deemed necessary.

Historical Aspects of Missionary Work with the Indians. To go into a detailed history of missionary activities among the Indians or to describe at length the existing activities is fortunately not necessary. The United States Board of Indian Commissioners early in 1927 issued as Bulletin No. 280 an eighty-four-page mimeographed report on "Christian Missions Among the American Indians: a review of the history, progress, present distribution and needs of the American Indian missions," with a foreword by Dr. Samuel A. Eliot. "The Red Man in the United States,"² by G. E. Lindquist, embodies the results of a survey launched in September, 1919, as part of the Inter-church World Movement and subsequently carried to completion in 1922 under the Committee on Social and Religious Surveys. It was made at the request of the Indian missionaries and workers gathered in conference at Wichita, Kansas. Although it is by no means exclusively a survey of missionary activities, it is rich in material regarding them.

With respect to the history of missionary activities it is probably enough to say that they date practically from the very begin-

² New York, 1923.

ning of the contact of the white man with the Indian. The policy of the government has always been to encourage missionary activities. In many cases the government has given the denominations land on or near the Indian reservations and has afforded them opportunities to work with the Indians, both on the reservations and in the government schools. For a period of about twelve years beginning in the Grant administration, the missionaries nominated the superintendents, but this system was short lived. For a very considerable period the government contributed directly from its own funds to contract boarding schools maintained by the missionaries, but this system led to denominational conflicts and was ultimately abolished by Congress. At present some contract mission schools still exist, but the funds used in payment are tribal and not governmental.

The Government and the Denominations. In the Grant administration the experiment was tried of apportioning the Indian jurisdictions among the several denominations partly in an effort to reduce denominational conflicts. Had some far-seeing statesman adopted this system from the outset, so that the first denomination entering a field had been given exclusive rights there, the system might have worked successfully and have prevented the unfortunate denominational rivalries. Attempted years after the missionary activities had started, it was probably inevitably doomed to failure because it excluded denominations from fields in which they had already worked and in which they had a following among the Indians. Probably every student of missionary activities among the Indians is conscious of the unfortunate results of denominational rivalries, but apparently the government by itself is powerless to meet the situation.

This matter of denominational rivalries is so important that it may be well to quote at some length from Mr. Lindquist's statement in the "Red Man in the United States":

Perhaps no harsher criticism has been made of the Christian Church than that caused by the rivalry among denominations. One can only bow in shame at the thought of what might have been the result of this country if a united church had offered to the Indians the simple message of Christianity in a way which would have reached into their every-day lives. The early missionaries, with their educational, agricultural and home-making gospel, laid

the foundations deep and strong for a Christian civilization. War, greed for land, and human jealousies broke up plan after plan, and mission after mission, until confusion reigned.

At last the cry arose, "It is better to educate than to fight; it is better to Christianize than to kill!" With President Grant a new era was inaugurated. As a preliminary step in his "Peace Policy" in 1869, he placed the superintendency of Nebraska, and that for Kansas and the Indian Territory, under the care of the Society of Friends. He further decided to invite the coöperation of other religious bodies besides the Quakers to take charge of these reservations, and to nominate such persons as they chose as agents, in the hope of avoiding the probable consequences of the appointment of political parasites to such positions. This invitation was accepted by the churches and the plan was followed for ten or twelve years, although it failed to accomplish all that had been hoped from it. Sectarian opposition arose in various places, and in 1881 a ruling of the Secretary of the Interior permitted ministers of any denomination to engage in mission work at will on the various reservations, "except where the presence of rival religious organizations would manifestly be perilous to peace and good order." In 1883 the Indian Commissioner interpreted this ruling as permitting any religious society to engage in mission work upon any reservation, "provided they did not undertake to interfere with agency matters."

That the Indian's understanding of denominational differences was even less than that of the ordinary layman is evident from the names given to the various denominations. The Friends continue to be "friends," but the Baptists are "put under the water," and the Methodists, "shouters," the Roman Catholics are "crosses himself" or "drags his coat," the Episcopalians are "white coats" or "long skirts," the Congregationalists and Presbyterians are "short coats," and in some fields of the early American Board work, the missionary is still referred to as "board on his shoulders." Certainly these are not titles which appeal to the reverence and dignity of the Indian any more than does the name of "chicken pulling" convey to the Navajo the real meaning of our Fourth of July.

That genuine advance was made, however, notwithstanding mistakes and difficulties, is clearly shown in the record. Mr. Lindquist quotes the tribute of James Mooney, long connected with the Smithsonian Institution, who was, he says, "never considered to be a great friend of missionary work":

In the four centuries of American history there is no more inspiring chapter of heroism, self-sacrifice, and devotion to high ideals than that offered by the Indian missions. Some of the mis-

sionaries were of noble blood and had renounced titles and estates to engage in the work; most of them were of finished scholarship and refined habit, and nearly all were of such exceptional ability as to have commanded attention in any community and to have possessed themselves of wealth and reputation, had they so chosen; yet they deliberately faced poverty and sufferings, exile and oblivion, ingratitude, torture, and death itself in the hope that some portion of a darkened world might be made better through their effort.

Results of Missionary Efforts. Let it be clearly and definitely said at the outset that the missionary activities are dominated by a high spirit of service, sacrifice, and devotion. Although isolated instances may be cited of the very human trait of selfishness, even on the part of missionaries, these instances have been exceedingly rare, and they never should be accepted as indicting missionaries as a class. The group as a whole is earnest, devoted, and self-sacrificing.

Let it also be said clearly that some of the missionary activities are of an extremely high order. Here and there the physical equipment and the exceptional work done by the missions stand out as a challenge to the government. The Ursuline Sisters' School for Girls at St. Ignatius, Montana, is not equalled in equipment by any government school in the entire Indian Service, with the possible exception of Bloomfield, Oklahoma. The government can learn a great deal from the pioneer educational work in character development carried on at the Santee Normal Training School at Santee, Nebraska. A lesson in how to deal with little girls in a boarding school, if boarding schools for them are necessary, could be learned from the small school at Fort Hall, Idaho, maintained by the Protestant Episcopal Church. Other educational and philanthropic activities in different parts of the country might be cited. But the spirit of the missionaries and the isolated instances of excellent work are the outstanding bright spots in a situation which is otherwise somewhat depressing.

The Contribution of the Mission Schools. The finest work of the missionaries has unquestionably been in the establishment of mission schools for Indian children. Like the government the missionaries have placed their main reliance for advancing the Indian race upon schools for the youth. These schools have been

discussed in the chapter on education and it is not necessary to repeat in full what was said there, although a brief summary may be desirable at this point.³

Mission schools at present may be justified on at least four grounds: (1) As supplementing existing facilities, (2) as agencies to do pioneer work not so likely to be done by public or government schools, (3) as furnishing school facilities under denominational auspices for those who prefer this kind of education, and (4) as training for leadership, especially religious leadership, of the Indian people.

The nation and the states are not now justified, however, in leaving upon missionary organizations the burden of supporting such mission schools as have been established primarily because of the lack of publicly supported schools. For the nation, as a nation, to let weak little denominational schools bear the burden of elementary schooling seems inexcusable.

The pioneering function will remain as the best justification for mission schools and other private educational enterprises. Abundant opportunity exists for needed experimentation that would be of direct benefit to the Indians and to other groups as well. Some mission schools have, as has been said, done excellent work in this field. The government can well profit from their successful experiments, although it should not leave all experimental and developmental work to them.

That parents who prefer to have their children schooled under private or denominational auspices have a right to do so, is a principle that has been generally accepted in the United States; and there is no reason why Indian parents should not have the same privilege as others. Equally definite, however, is the principle that in return for this right of education in private and denominational schools, the community shall hold these schools to certain minimum standards. The government should exert its rights, as most states do now, to supervise denominational and other private schools. This supervision, however, should be tolerant and coöperative rather than inspectional. The surest way to keep private schools on a high plane, moreover, is for the government to set a standard to which only the best private schools can attain and to have as

³ Pages 409 to 411.

its educational representatives persons whose character and professional attainments necessarily command respect.

Furnishing leadership, especially religious leadership for the Indian people, is a legitimate aim of the mission schools. Under ordinary conditions leadership of any type is more likely to develop out of schools that are operated with the highest religious ideals.

These grounds fully justify the continuance of mission activities in providing schools, but denominations sponsoring mission enterprises should appreciate the necessity for restricting their effort to work that can be adequately supported and for which high standards of personnel can be maintained. Those missionary schools that are materially below the government schools should be as quickly as possible abolished or merged with stronger more promising institutions unless the supporting denominations are ready to develop them promptly to an acceptable state of efficiency.

Taken as a whole, however, the mission schools are unquestionably the best product of the mission activities. If the schools alone were considered without reference to the life of the adult Indians and the Indian family, there would be less occasion for the feeling of disappointment over the general results of missionary activities.

The work done by the missionaries in the government schools has already been discussed in the chapter of the report dealing with education⁴ and what was said there need not be repeated at length here. It is generally true that too much reliance has been placed on the religious service and not enough on the other means of appealing to the interests of children and influencing them by indirection.

Indian Home and Family Life Little Influenced by Missions. As has been set forth in earlier chapters, especially those dealing with family and community life and with health, neither the work of the government nor of the missionaries has really reached the home and family life of the Indians to any very marked degree. Exceptions must, of course, be made to any such generalization, because numerous cases can be cited where one or the other of these agencies, and sometimes both, have achieved very considerable success, yet such cases are the exception rather than the rule. The typical Indian home discloses the need for training and influence in sanitation, hygiene, and orderly and methodical care. In

⁴ Pages 396 to 398.

some places facilities for cleanliness of home and person are lacking because of isolation and inadequate water supply, but even where such is not the case much remains to be done. If the position be taken that matters of this kind are not the province of the missionary and that the missionary is concerned solely with the spiritual welfare of the Indian, then from that point of view the existence of such conditions is no occasion for any feeling of depression over missionary activities. From the point of view of the survey staff, however, it is difficult to see how a spiritual awakening and a high standard of ethics could develop without bearing fruit indirectly in higher standards of family and community life. Low standards would seem to constitute evidence of the fact that in many instances the missionaries have not availed themselves of the excellent contact and approach that can be gained through taking an active and sympathetic interest in the family and community life of the Indians, especially in matters of health.

Indian Churches Rarely Self-Sustaining. In general it is probably true that the missionaries have placed their main reliance for reaching the adult Indian upon the traditional church activities, conducted in much the same way as are activities for white church members. Here and there are some notable exceptions where church services are but incidental to a very much broader program for adults, but these exceptions after all are not numerous. Where the church service is the main approach to adults, both active church membership and church attendance are generally small. Several missionaries met the inquiry as to the number of active church members with an almost despairing shake of the head and said that active church membership as the term is used in white churches is almost non-existent. Christian churches actually supported by the Indians themselves are few in number, and most of the missionaries say that their work is almost entirely dependent on white support. This lack of Indian support may be due in part to poverty, and in part to the fact that Indians have learned to expect the white man to do for them, but the dominant factor is unquestionably lack of interest. Where the interest of the Indians is aroused as is the case in the Indian Shaker Church, the church is supported entirely by the Indians. In eastern Oklahoma are found some Christian churches which are largely self-supporting, although the

Indian minister generally provides his own maintenance by secular labor during the week.

Native Religious Leadership Lacking. As conspicuous as the absence of thriving Indian churches is the lack of native religious leaders. In their primitive state the Indians are not without religious organization and leadership. Their failure to develop independent Christian congregations may be due in part to the general conditions to which the race has been subjected, for the Indians have failed to produce leaders in other departments of community life; but the development of native leadership, whether or not an ostensible object of missionary effort, has too often in practice been omitted from the actual objectives of mission work.

Religious leadership might by some people be expected from the Indian young people who have been in the boarding schools, either missionary or governmental, for in both the reservation and non-reservation government boarding schools, and especially in the mission schools, the Indian youth gives much more time to attendance on religious services and exercises than does the ordinary white child. The testimony of the missionaries and others on the reservations, is, however, to the effect that the returned student who has an active interest in the church and church services is a rare exception. In this connection it should be noted, however, that, again as a rule, neither the missionaries nor the government has worked out a concrete program or challenge to lay before the boarding school youth upon his return and, as has been noted in other chapters of this report, his education has rarely been directly pointed toward an effective life back on the reservation. Unless he happens to be the exceptional youth, and this is true not only of Indians, his interests in the late teens and early twenties do not center primarily on church activities.

The church, therefore, if it is to depend on returned students for leadership and organized religious activity, must have a program which is much more varied than one consisting mainly of church services or other ordinary church activities.

The Outlook for Indian Missions. The views of the missionaries themselves with respect to the outlook for the future, vary materially, and it seemed to the survey staff that a general distinction should be drawn between the Roman Catholics and the Protestants in this respect. The prevailing feeling among the Roman

Catholics appears to be one of optimism, with only here and there a contrary note, and this is more frequently voiced by a parish priest with both Indian and white charges than by one giving all his time to missionary work for the Indians. Protestant missionaries on the other hand, especially those doing work on the reservations, as a rule appear to be much less hopeful. The exceptions are usually those missionaries who have worked out a broad program and who are achieving positive successes along certain lines which give them courage and hope.

Certain apparent reasons for these differences in point of view deserve special consideration by all interested in missions to the Indians, because they have an important bearing on the success of missionary projects.

The Protestant missionary in the Indian field is subject, as a rule, to a greater degree of isolation than is the Catholic missionary. The number of Protestant missionaries who are the only ones of their faith in a jurisdiction appears to be larger than the number of Catholic missionaries thus isolated. The Catholic missionary is more likely to be one of several, either at the station, or in the general neighborhood; thus he has more opportunity for friendly association. The Catholic missionary, too, is generally a member of an order in his church and has the associations which arise from that fact. The Catholics are much more highly organized, and visits from other members of the organization are much more frequent. The Catholic missionary thus is strengthened by the sense of the strength of the organization which he represents, and he probably does not have the feeling that so much rests upon him personally. Possibly this fact explains why the Catholic missionaries generally take a long-time view of the situation and are hopeful, whereas the Protestant missionaries are more inclined to measure things by what can be done in their own life time of service and are more easily discouraged.

Another fact to be stated is that the firmer organization and control in the Catholic Church permits of a greater degree of personnel administration. The Catholic missionaries are as a rule members of fairly numerous orders, doing different kinds of work in different communities. Thus the directing powers have an opportunity to select for positions in the Indian mission field members of the order who are believed to have special qualifications

for the task in hand. The missionaries in the field are visited frequently by representatives of the directing powers of their order, who study thoroughly the general situation and are in a position to make changes freely if changes are deemed advisable.

The organization and control in the Protestant churches are as a rule much looser and the mission forces less mobile. More thus depends on the ability and the personality of the individual missionary in the field. The greater freedom from supervision and control among Protestant missions gives rise to greater variation between different stations even where maintained by the same denomination. Although it permits some weak organizations to exist it offers opportunity for initiative and experimentation and permits an outstanding personality to exert a strong influence in developing individual Indians. It is quite probable, however, that the Protestant missions could, without sacrificing the advantages of individual effort and local control, achieve certain obvious advantages of organization, by pooling their interests in some interdenominational committee for Indian work similar to the Committee on Cooperation in Latin America.

The question may be raised as to whether the Catholic missionaries are not on the whole the more tolerant of things Indian, a natural result perhaps of taking the long time rather than the short time view. This difference, too, may be associated with their greater opportunity for friendly contacts with others of their faith. The isolation of some of the Protestant missionaries is distressing, and it is not surprising that in some instance they lose that calm balance and sense of proportion that comes from a greater variety of human contacts. When isolation leads to special emphasis on doctrinal details or on strict observance of minute matters of church discipline, it is particularly unfortunate, for these matters are remote from the thoughts and needs of the Indian. What he requires is emphasis on a very few fundamentals and much teaching and aid in the application of those fundamentals to ordinary daily life.

Difficulties Attending Missionary Efforts. No report on missionary activities would be in any sense fair or complete that failed clearly to recognize the tremendous handicaps under which all Christian missionaries must labor. These handicaps may be divided

into two broad classes; first, those which the missionaries and the churches cannot directly influence and control, since they are either inherent in the problem itself or are the results of governmental policies past or present which they may to some extent influence but cannot direct; second, those which are within the power of the churches and the missionaries to change and control if indeed they are within the power of anyone to control.

Handicaps Originating in Interracial Relations. A few missionaries, like a few government employees, would doubtless place first among their inherent difficulties the Indians themselves. Little evidence, however, seems to support the opinion that the Indians have a distinctive and peculiar racial psychology that makes them perverse and difficult. It is noteworthy that this unfavorable opinion is generally held by those who have themselves found the Indians perverse and difficult, whereas those who have succeeded with them generally hold the view that they are much like people of other races. These successful people distinguish between individuals and say that some Indians are very responsive and some very unresponsive, while the majority are not noteworthy for either characteristic, which is an entirely normal situation. It must be remembered, however, that the missionaries are in many jurisdictions dealing with a primitive people, very much scattered and speaking another tongue. These difficulties have been set forth more at length in the chapters dealing with the work of the government employees and need not here be repeated.

The first great inherent difficulty which the Christian missionaries have to face results from the white infiltration into the Indian country. Many a missionary has said, "If we had only the Indian to deal with, we could make much better progress." No race has been subjected to such recurring misfortunes due to land hunger on the part of the whites as has the red man in America. The stage could not have been better set for the exploitation of a race. The Indian occupied a country in the temperate zone, abounding in great natural resources of which he was wholly ignorant. He was content with the small living gained from hunting, fishing, and gathering native foods, in some cases practicing a little agriculture. He was devoid of the power that comes from scientific knowledge and equipment and, most important of all, lacked a language medium through which to acquire the white

man's knowledge and power. He was compelled by the logic of events to change in a few decades his whole mode of existence and to adopt the habits and ways of a foreign race. The process which he faced involved indeed the alienization of this the original American. The white man, on the other hand, with an inheritance centuries in the making, keen as a competitor, pressing his every economic advantage, has legitimately and otherwise dispossessed the Indian. This dispossession has not happened in a day, for the government itself through its agents in the field has for these many years undertaken to protect and conserve Indian property. Unfortunately both for the government and for the missionaries, one element in our civilization seeks no interest but its own, playing without conscience on the Indians' weakness and destroying the constructive work of years. How many a missionary when preaching the white man's religion to the Indians must be embarrassed by the thought of what the white race has done to the Indians? What must be the thoughts of the intelligent Indian when he hears the great precepts of the Christian faith and contrasts them with the actions of the white men toward the Indian race? In some localities the major problem has become the Christianization of the white neighborhoods if ever any considerable good is to be done the Indians.

Low Standards of Living Associated with Low Moral Tone. The general low level of economic life prevailing among the Indians is another serious impediment to successful missionary work. The habit of departmentalized thinking has led people to treat economics as one thing and morals as another, without appreciating how intimately the two are connected. The execution of plans through difficult economic situations develops power of perseverance; the production of goods for the sake of one's family is altruistic; the desire to labor to replace what one has consumed is morality making for community welfare. In the past, in dealing with the Indians, this relationship between economic development and moral development has too generally been ignored. The tendency has been to stress the conservation of the Indian's property rather than the development of the Indian himself through teaching him to use his property. The crying need for the race is a policy which shall be human centered and not property centered.

The highest general level of ethical development, as might have been expected, obtains among Indians who have learned and found their labor sufficiently rewarded to enable them to maintain a reasonable standard of living. Indians who have not worked or whose labor has been put into the less productive channels have suffered a lowering standard of living accompanied by a lowering ethical standard. As Benjamin Franklin said, "It's hard to make an empty sack stand upright." Among Indians as among whites, where great wealth has come unearned, a low type of ethical development generally prevails. The beneficial restraints and lessons to be learned through the necessity to earn a living have been lost and the Indians have given themselves over to the forces of dissipation. Time has become leisure time, and idleness has become the habitual mode of life or the bore of inactivity has led to the fevered demand for a thrill, with resulting profligacy. The result has been social degeneracy.

Handicaps Resulting from the Type of Government Control of the Indians. The general effect of governmental control and supervision of the Indian and his property has in many instances been exactly contrary to what was intended. The government has time and time again permitted the Indian to enjoy unearned income through the all too ready granting of fee simple patents resulting in quick sales of lands. Most excellent productive agricultural lands have thus been lost to the Indians. Many Indian reservations show from fifty per cent to as high as ninety-five per cent loss to white possession. This great economic loss has resulted in the general lowering of morals, starting with the unlimited spending of unearned income and ending finally in despondency over the loss of the only visible means of support the Indian had. The government still permits a considerable proportion of the able bodied Indians to lease their lands to white men. The rent money, although not enough to maintain the Indians according to a reasonable standard of living, has permitted them to live according to a low standard without labor. It is not difficult to foresee what would become of any race in the course of three generations subjected to a state of affairs where the chief business of the people is aimless living and inactivity. This policy develops in the Indian the sense that he is not responsible for his own welfare. It smother's for want of expression any ambition for productive enterprise as well

as the indispensable qualities of initiative and resourcefulness. This policy of the government is beyond the control of the missionaries, and yet it constitutes one of the greatest if not the greatest barrier to effective constructive work.

In justice to the government it should be said that even as events moved too swiftly for the Indians, they also moved too swiftly for the whites. Problems of great magnitude arose to confront the government, not of its own choice but inherent in the unfolding drama of a nation in the making. For these problems it could in no possible way have made adequate preparation. Under these circumstances many of the old Indian policies were born. The problems of social forces and economic adjustment were less understood than at present and the principles which must be applied in their solution has not been formulated. The application of economic and social principles in the solution of such difficulties is a relatively new development. The nation has now reached a period where its government can effect great change for the better by re-examining its policies and reconstructing its organization for making these policies effective. In many of its activities, notably in the Department of Agriculture, the Public Health Service, the Federal Board for Vocational Education, the Bureau of Labor Statistics, the Bureau of Education, and the Children's Bureau, the government has demonstrated what can be accomplished by the employment of persons who have demonstrated their qualifications for expert work in the development of the economic and social condition of its people. This same type of expert economic and social service can be extended to the Indians, thus opening to them the door to real progress. The missionaries can then do their part and help to speed the day when the Indian may take his place as a citizen practicing Christian ethics.

Disabilities Existing Within the Mission Organizations. A good many of the difficulties at least partially within the control of the mission bodies themselves would seem to spring in no small measure from a failure to perceive clearly the double objective of missions. Too often, though by no means universally, the great objective of ministry to temporal needs is all but lost sight of in the other great objective of evangelization, while in some instances the zeal for evangelization is even narrowed down to the partisan championship of the interests of the sect. If the ministry to human

wants ought ever to be emphasized in the missions field, then an appropriate case for emphasis exists among the Indians. In the first place their needs are great, a fact that will not be elaborated here, and ministry to temporal needs is clearly in itself a worthy end of Christian activity. In the second place such a ministry is also in itself a means to evangelization. Good lives are the most effective sermons. Indians, like all other human beings, are more influenced by deeds than words. If, as is sometimes asserted, Indians as a race are peculiarly susceptible to the practical expressions of religion, then Indian missions in order to achieve evangelization should be peculiarly rich in a varied expression of Christian love in the form of good works. If sufficient emphasis were placed upon this practical type of ministry, the problems thus faced would prove so great and so engrossing that little energy would remain for the emphasis of sectarian differences. One of the fundamental difficulties with the work at the present time may therefore be stated as the failure to develop a broad program touching the lives of the Indians at many points.

Failure to Develop a Broad Program. The outstanding missionaries identified with the work among the Indians have always recognized that human welfare is a matter involving physical as well as spiritual service and have been intensely interested in all human relationships common to men. By pastoral visits, conferences with the Indians, and the mastery of native tongues, they have succeeded in establishing the vital contacts for the winning of a race. They have been statesmen in government coöperation. Their work has filled the government service with inspiration as they have demonstrated their ability to point the way for a people emerging into new standards. Unfortunately, missionaries of this quality have at all times been rare. Some are to be found today working effectively with individuals and communities and pointing the way to methods of work worthy of wide adoption. Illustrations may be given.

The mission school at Ganado, Arizona, one of the schools developed under the Women's Board of the Presbyterian Church, has displayed direct interest in Indian life and culture, particularly in the translation of Indian languages and in keeping alive Navajo work in silver as a craft for certain of the students. Efforts of

the school are not confined to the boys and girls, but extend to the surrounding community in various ways, notably in the remarkable economic service rendered to the people of the locality by irrigating the country for thirteen miles below the school site and digging wells under unusual difficulties. A huge "hogan" is maintained as a community meeting place for both church members and others. A few of the older students are being trained in leadership, who eventually should be ready to engage in similar practical undertakings either in this community or elsewhere. That the value of a mission enterprise may have little to do with the actual size and amount of natural resources, is shown by the success of the small but effective hospital and school work of the Episcopal mission among the Navajos at Fort Defiance.

The missionaries at St. John's in the Pima country, besides conducting purely religious services and operating a boarding school of several hundred students, maintain a large playground for adult Indians for athletic contests and baseball and football. On these grounds a small store is located in one end of an amusement parlor allotted for use on rainy days. Rules and regulations governing this place are much more liberal and plastic than those obtaining in the school proper. In these rooms instruction is given in what the priest terms secular subjects. The profits of the small store are available for the good of the tribe, and its specific uses are voted upon from time to time by the Indians themselves. At one time the proceeds may be to pay the funeral expenses of some member of the tribe, at another time to help the sick and indigent, or to pay in part the scholarship of some promising student. Here the missionary finds his best means of contact with the returned students and adult Indians. Gradually he is increasing his power to direct the social life of this tribe to a higher plane, to provide for its recreational needs, and to deal in most intimate fashion with the Indians' fundamental needs of self-support, the establishment of self-esteem, and the security of family and property interests. Without a doubt, if this missionary had the equipment and the means he would also be carrying on classes in dramatics, bowling, basket-weaving, first aid, dressmaking, and swimming, as well as the usual activities of the girl and boy scouts, and various other social gatherings. Here is religion in practice laying hold of the expressional side of life.

What force and regulation, repression and negation fail to accomplish, he is achieving through patient, wise direction and growth.

The following is an account of the activities of a native Indian missionary among the Kickapoos of Oklahoma:

Other special programs included the clinic work of the State Health Department of Oklahoma and the community work of three extension men from the International Harvester Company from Oklahoma City. The head of the health department, Dr. Blatchley, with her nurses, Mrs. Gilham and Miss Delasky, held the clinic in my study for two days. They examined over twenty babies during the first day, and school children on the second day. Many of these babies and mothers had never seen a white doctor before. We were very happy in the response and their willingness to take an interest in the clinic. The doctor at the Sanatorium at Shawnee says that results of this clinic are showing up in that Kickapoo people are taking their children there now for treatment.

The man from the International Harvester Company gave us a series of lectures with charts, slides and films for two days. The first day they focussed their talks upon the cow and chickens on the farm. The second day the discussion was upon the use, conservation and development of values of the soil. The entire community was invited in for these two days, including white farmers.

The Dutch Reformed Church has a mission at Colony, Oklahoma, with a long history of varied activities. At present the workers maintain among other things a community house, a maternity room, and the Mohonk Lodge. The work of the Mohonk Lodge is a distinctive contribution to the management of handicrafts worthy of study by the Indian Office. For twenty years the workers have been engaged in promoting the making and sale of beadwork as a means of livelihood for Indian groups with slight economic resources. To one group of Indians in a distant state, the sales through Mohonk Lodge have been the means of avoiding starvation.

Many ministers in white communities are very much aware of the fact that the spiritual needs of the people involve far more contacts than can be secured through the traditional church activities. They know that disease, poverty, and the failure to fit into a social environment may hamper the soul as well as the body. They are for this reason glad to see their work supplemented by many other organizations, some of a distinctly religious character

and others purely secular. Such organizations as the Y. M. C. A., the Y. W. C. A., the Knights of Columbus, the Red Cross, the Boy Scouts, the Girl Scouts and Campfire Girls, and the Junior Red Cross, are needed, on the one hand to help church members to make practical contributions to the moral and social advancement of a people, and on the other hand to furnish non-church members with the opportunity to render a service to their fellow men in a way that appeals to their religion and humanitarian impulses. If such activities are needed in a city population at least nominally Christian, how much more are corresponding activities needed with the Indians where the problem is to establish the first contact and to awaken the first interest.

The program recently adopted by a number of religious denominations for work in Latin-American countries emphasizes a four-fold obligation, namely, in the fields of health, education, recreation, and evangelistic work. The churches and the missionaries must appreciate that to do effective work among the Indians they must adopt the broad program and not the narrow one; that evangelistic services alone will not establish the first contacts and awaken the first interest. Possibly the type of religious service which will deeply appeal to the Indian will evolve later when the Indians themselves find in it an opportunity for self expression.

Lack of Preparation for Specific Lines of Effort. The effective development of a broad progress is dependent to a considerable degree upon specialized forms of service. Without doubt great need exists, among Catholics as well as Protestants, for more missionaries with definite preparation for specific lines of work. Too many of the sisters of the various Catholic orders engaged in the work of educating Indian girls are handicapped in the practical service they are attempting to render Indian families because they themselves have not had home economics training. Especially serious is the absence of the scientific knowledge of food values essential to the teaching of healthful food habits, which limits the value of otherwise excellent practical training in food preparation.

Even though the aim of the missionary is to make converts, the temporal needs of the Indians are so great as to constitute the obvious first approach. These needs involve the technical and difficult problems of achieving health, economic self-support, and the wholesome and normal development of individuals in their family

and community life and in their relations with white people and white civilization. One of the most successful superintendents in the Service says that since the Indian religions are exceedingly practical the Indians understand the practical expression of religions on the part of missionaries far more readily than our forms of worship. If this is indeed the case, then nurses, doctors, industrial teachers, and family and community social workers are especially qualified to exemplify the spirit of Christ in healing the sick and comforting the poor, and missions can hardly afford to be without various of these specialized workers.

Lack of Organized Supervision. As might be expected, there seems to be a greater difference in the effectiveness of the work from mission to mission than from agency to agency. This is due largely to the fact that no central interdenominational supervision of mission work exists, and that therefore no standards are set up as a minimum below which the work should not fall. As a result of this condition a weak denomination with low educational standards for its missionaries may maintain indefinitely a mission station manned by people with only the most elementary education and with no training whatever for the teaching of community work that they attempt, while a strong denomination with high standards of general education, for lack of any effective supervisory organization, may lend support in isolated spots to work of a specialized nature assumed by missionaries with no technical and little real understanding of the problems involved in their secular activities. The worst feature of such situations is not that the Indians of the localities are poorly served, but that the governing boards remain ignorant of the real problems of Indian missions and that as a consequence the great bodies of church members that they represent have little knowledge and little interest in Indian missions and therefore little reason for extending whole-hearted support.

A second result of the lack of supervision is seen in the occasional instances of long term misfits. It is quite possible for missionaries without the personal qualifications necessary for work with the Indians to maintain themselves indefinitely in isolated locations, obstacles both to the work of the church and to the efforts of the government. In the absence of some effective plan of supervision, there is little to protect a denomination from a drift of the unsuccessful in white pastorates or in prominent

mission stations to the inconspicuous and poorly supported stations in remote parts of the Indian country.

Fully as serious as the failure to eliminate unsatisfactory workers or to achieve an understanding of general needs through a study of local problems, is the failure to develop those workers who are capable of long continued growth in usefulness, or in other words, the failure to regard the work of the able missionary as a profession rather than as a mere vocation. This professional development depends largely upon such contacts as can be supplied only through intelligent supervision.

Lack of Adequate Financial Support. Financial support as a rule is meager in view of the work to be done. This is no doubt due largely to the fact that the constituents of the boards have not been challenged by any program at once broad and specific, and this in turn is due to the fact that in some instances the boards themselves have too little first hand knowledge of the real situation to be in a position to set forth the needs of the race.

Inadequate support is almost everywhere evident in the mission fields. It affects both personnel and plant and equipment, although in respect to personnel the distinction must again be drawn between the Catholic missions on the one hand and the Protestant on the other. As has already been said the Catholic missionaries in a given jurisdiction are as a rule more numerous and hence less isolated than the Protestant and they have the strength and the resources which come from effective organization. The rules of their church regarding celibacy relieve them, too, of the family cares and responsibilities which are so pressing upon married Protestant missionaries and married government workers stationed in the remoter parts of the Indian country, and leave them free to concentrate greater personal interest upon the Indians. Even among the Catholic missions, however, it appears that a material advance could be made if a larger personnel were available so that more work could be done among the adult Indians and especially so that more attention could be given to the vocational guidance and placement of the Indian youth leaving the mission schools.

Citation of the fact that many Protestant missionaries in the Indian field are finding it hard to support their families and to educate their children should not be construed as a recommendation by the survey staff that the Protestant denominations should

send only unmarried missionaries to the Indians. Several illustrations could be given of the distinct value of the presence among the Indians of whites maintaining high standards of family life. Some of the missionaries have found it possible to make certain of the Indians friends of the family and to have them participate in some of the activities of the home. Such contacts are obviously invaluable. An officer of the Indian Service with wide acquaintance among Indians believes that the greatest contribution of missions to the race has been the opportunity thus afforded certain groups of Indians to know intimately some able, devoted, outstanding members of the white race, a knowledge invaluable to interracial relationships as well as to the development of sound ideals of life in the rapid change from primitive to modern environment.

The Protestant denominations, however, should recognize the difficulties confronting the missionary with a family and should provide for him in a way that will enable him to make reasonable provision for his family. What has been said regarding the government employees in the Indian country applies probably to an even greater extent to the Protestant missionaries. Salaries are so small as to make provision for the care and education of children difficult, and many a missionary has to devote a considerable part of his time to efforts to eke out an existence through some form of agriculture. The missionaries' need of recreation, of modern conveniences, of larger contacts with the outside world, and of relief from responsibility and strain through trained assistants cannot be met for lack of missionary funds. Too frequently the missionary and his family must bear the whole burden. Division of labor is impossible, and the program can include only what this devoted family can itself accomplish and often they have to enter into fields for which they have no special training or equipment.

The plants at various of the mission schools, both Catholic and Protestant, are so old that the mere expense of repair and maintenance becomes a serious problem. The old buildings were constructed prior to the day when light, ventilation, heat, sanitary facilities, and fire protection were given scientific consideration, and many of them are unsatisfactory in one or more of these important matters. As in the government schools, the dormitories are generally of the congregate, institutional type, and it is rare to find the cottage system or any other marked effort to modify insti-

tutional life in order that the children may have training for family life. Serious consideration should be given the question of replacing some of these old structures with buildings more in accordance with modern standards and better adapted to the purposes which they are to serve. Such a course is particularly desirable because several of the schools are crowded to or beyond their capacity. Even some of the newer structures leave much to be desired both in design and equipment. Special attention should be given to fire hazard, because in many cases the buildings are in no sense fire proof, electric wiring is of the open-knob-and-tube type, heating is by stoves or other very simple means, and fire escapes are inadequate. Some buildings of this type are so crowded that children are quartered in the attic floor directly under the roof and at a very considerable distance from the ground.

In some schools the meager equipment, especially in the kitchen and laundry, is due at least in part to the idea that the equipment must be like what the girls will have when they go out from school. In a very small school this idea has some value, but in an institution of any considerable size it is responsible for a system of drudgery. The teachers should have good equipment in order to free the pupils for other things that are more educational than uninterrupted ironing, for example. It is a mistaken economy, too, that obliges the schools to have old-time double fixed seats in a kindergarten room because somebody was able to get them cheap. A member of the survey staff, who was on the whole a sympathetic observer of Catholic mission schools, comments as follows on one of these schools:

There is the usual formality in the classroom. Catholic Indian schools are usually one generation behind even government boarding schools in their schoolroom equipment, desks, and manner and technique of teaching, though the unusually fine human qualities of the women in this service atone for much.

Lack of Concentration and Coördination of Activities. Want of funds and the enormous extent of the Indian country are doubtless responsible for the lack of concentration and coördination observed especially among the Protestant missions. In the attempt to cover the field more churches have been established than are properly financed, and they are so widely scattered that in no

organic way does the work of one supplement the other, nor is the strength of one utilized for strengthening the weak spots of the other or the work as a whole. Newly established churches in white pioneer sections soon became self-supporting and self-propagating, but this is not at all true of Indian churches. Self-supporting churches, so considered among the Indians, are so only when the native pastor works all the week to earn his living. The situation could apparently be improved through securing more adequate support; or through concentration of existing support on a smaller number of stations, preferably in one or two sections of the country; or through the adoption of the policy of supplementing government effort in some very definite and restricted form of work requiring less outlay, as, for example, the support of doctors or nurses instead of the maintenance of entire establishments.

The work of the Y. W. C. A. among the Indians constitutes a good example of the effective restriction of religious work to a limited field. Instead of making scattered attempts to do many different kinds of mission work the Indian division specializes in work with girl students in a few non-reservation schools. Their efforts have resulted in the higher education of some capable young Indian women who are today rendering distinctive types of service to the race.

Lack of Coöperation and Harmony between Denominations. In no small measure both the lack of financial support and the absence of coördination have their root in the lack of coöperation and harmony between the several religious denominations. The importance of this factor in impeding the progress of the entire mission work can scarcely be overstated. This matter was touched upon briefly under the history of missionary activities and there a quotation was inserted from Mr. Lindquist's "Red Man in the United States" which should be reread in this connection.⁵ The results of this lack of harmony may be treated under different heads: (1) The confusion that has arisen in the minds of the Indians; (2) the political consequences that have followed division on denominational grounds; and (3) the impairment of the work from the standpoint of the effective utilization of missionary funds.

1. Persons who study the history, doctrine, polity, and work of the religious denominations of the United States, as given for

⁵ See pages 821 and 823.

example in the United States Census Report on Religious Bodies, appreciate that the tendency among Christian people in this country has been to put the emphasis on the one point of difference rather than on the ninety-nine of agreement. Divisions have taken place on matters of doctrine, polity, and forms of worship, some major and some minor. The great political issue arising from slavery resulted in many divisions. Churches have thus divided or groups broken away so that each group has a doctrine, polity, and form of worship which is reasonably consistent with its own religious views and, it may even be said, reasonably satisfying to its own tastes in respect to such matters as form of worship. The fact that these divisions were born in controversy unquestionably explains the fact that the emphasis is almost invariably placed on the distinctions and not on the similarities.

With the question whether this minute division is good or bad for the Christian religion as a whole, this report has nothing to do. It is cited to show that the Indians cannot be expected to trace the historical roots of the many doctrines, dogmas, and practices, and to harmonize to their own satisfaction the conflicting teachings and ways of those who come to them declaring the ultimate faith. Insofar as the missionaries place emphasis on the matters of differences and not on the matters of agreement, they bewilder the Indians and retard their ready acceptance of the fundamentals of Christian character and Christian work. The Indians, with their keen power of observation and their ability to characterize in a few descriptive words, are likely to bring against the missionary the effective Indian weapon of ridicule, as is so well illustrated in the quotation from Mr. Lindquist. One of the government superintendents who is outstanding for his ability to understand Indians and to reach them, comments on the hard, practical common sense which they display in judging of things white, and of the extreme necessity for having what is brought to them so basic and fundamental that it can stand against this examination. The successful missionaries have undoubtedly understood this fact and have laid their emphasis on the very few basic fundamentals which find their place in every Christian church, and have been extremely charitable toward the points of difference. If the question should be asked what these essentials are and it should become necessary to be specific, resort would be taken to Matthew 23: 37-40, "Jesus

said unto him, 'Thou shalt love the Lord thy God with all thy heart and with all thy soul and with all thy mind.' This is the first and great commandment. And the second is like unto it, 'Thou shalt love thy neighbor as thyself.' On these two commandments hang all the law and the prophets."

2. The conflict in the teaching regarding matters of doctrine and forms of worship have not only retarded the acceptance of the fundamentals of the Christian religion; they have developed factionalism among the Indians, and have caused great difficulty in the administration of Indian affairs. On one reservation an exceptionally able superintendent felt the need of an elected Indian council with which he could work. He was later transferred and promoted, and did not remain to carry through his plans. The elected council promptly went to pieces on the rocks of church differences. In another jurisdiction where the Indians have a government of their own, it has largely ceased to function because each of two rival factions claims to be the duly elected government and they cannot work together on the essential community enterprises. This particular controversy has various angles and church differences are one of them, though possibly not the most important. In some instances the effectiveness of the Court of Indian Offenses is seriously impaired by this type of factionalism and the superintendent is placed in a highly embarrassing position. The only way for some superintendents to maintain neutrality is to abandon such constructive plans as necessitate the whole-hearted coöperation of all. These illustrations might be assumed to reflect a strong and active church membership, but according to the testimony of most of the missionaries such is not the real fact. The existence of differences among the missionaries, and between the missionaries and some of the government employees, permit church matters to be drawn in to complicate other issues. Conflicts and factionalism would unquestionably exist if there were no missionaries and no church rivalries, but the task of the government would be enormously simplified in dealing with such difficulties if no missionary or church were in any way involved in them.

3. No student of Indian affairs can fail to be impressed by the duplication of effort among the various missions and the local government office in the services they attempt to render the Indian community. Everywhere the facilities of the Indian Service are

inadequate to the needs of the people, so that opportunity is not lacking to supplement government effort by work planned with reference to some desirable division of labor or territory. Everywhere the field of service is so comprehensive that if the denominations could agree on a well planned local program and then apportion the various undertakings among themselves, existing funds might be used effectively, whereas at present they are often wasted in avoidable duplication and rivalry. The two outstanding difficulties in many such situations are the narrow conception of the work as having the one end of securing converts, and the lack of specialized training necessary to a division of labor.

Failure to Utilize Indian Religions and Ethics. The next difficulty to be considered is the common failure to study sympathetically and understandingly the Indians' own religions and ethics and to use what is good in them as the foundation upon which to build. From this statement it must not be assumed that such a course has never been followed. This method of understanding and adapting the native religions and ethics has uniformly been the strategy of such great missionary leaders as Eliot, Zeisberger, Whipple, Hare, Williamson, Riggs, Spalding, Roe, and the Misses McBeth. It is indispensable if the race is to be won to Christianity.

Each Indian tribe has had its own religion and its own code of ethics, and therefore it is not possible to present one brief summary of Indian religion and Indian ethics. Each group of missionaries must study the Indians in the jurisdiction where they are located in order to get a clear understanding of the local problem. If the missionary is to reconstruct the life of the Indian by a new gospel he must be able to see the social edifice already there and have the power to evaluate its structural qualities. The careful study of the part that Indian religions and Indian ethics have played in the establishment of the Indian's social attitude is indispensable, for beyond question the missionary is primarily seeking attitudes, responses, appreciations, and fellowships.

The study will generally reveal strong intimations if not positive assertions of the first principles of many of the great doctrines of world religions, and therefore the mind of the missionary should be sympathetically engaged to discover if perchance the Indian, too, has not worshipped at the altar of the "unknown God." A religion founded upon belief in a Supreme Spirit, the divine origin

of the universe, immortality of the soul, and the immediacy and responsiveness of the Deity to human needs has basic factors which can very readily find a home in the great religion which the missionary brings. The attempt blindly to destroy the whole Indian religion may in effect be an attack on some of the very elements of religious belief which the missionary himself espouses and which he hopes the Indian will adopt. By the practice of condemnation of all things Indian, the Indian is rendered hostile, and in self-defense clings all the more tenaciously to his religion.

The objective of the great missionaries of the past was the preservation of the deep reverence and faith in the divine and unseen so characteristic of the Indian. In great patience and hope they waited for the processes of education to eradicate superstition. They accorded a high place to the race which, under the inspiration of its own religion found no place in its vocabulary to curse the Great Spirit and no room in its philosophy to doubt the existence of God. What these men and women gave the Indian race was a new and lofty conception of the Great Spirit. The new teaching conveyed the conception of a Spirit, a Creator, universal, clothed with moral majesty, and with the motive power of love and benevolence for all mankind. They taught the Indians to dispense with magic, with the occult, and to work out their adaptation to modern civilized life with ordered reason and labor. Without question this policy of toleration was in great part due to their mastery of the native Indian language. With this language medium they could sound the depth of the currents of Indian life. With understanding sympathy and as master builders they could lead their converts out into a comprehensive faith without the loss of all the treasures of their Indian heritage.

The processes of education and the scientific interpretation of nature should be the missionary's reliance for the eradication of the elements of superstition in Indian religions. Superstition gives way before scientific knowledge. Once the Hopi is reasonably supplied with water by the government engineers, as he will be some day, the Hopi rain god, the Snake, will depart to return no more. Great advance in sanitation and hygiene and in the elimination of malnutrition by economic improvement and proper dietary habits will demonstrate to the Indians that the medicine man is a useless adjunct of Indian society.

Lack of Success in Developing Indian Leadership. Without doubt the ultimate success of Indian missions depends upon the development of leadership within the native congregations. One of the outstanding policies of all successful missionaries has been the employment of the native leaders. Pride in their own leadership does not deter them from giving the Indian leader a large place in their programs. They recognize that they themselves are only temporary factors; that the native must be the perpetual, permanent maintainer of the work. To this end they labor with all their might. They accord the native of ability and promise an ever-increasing share of authority and influence, and with unselfishness indicative of their own greatness, go so far as to transfer to him the fruits of many years of missionary labor, relinquishing gradually the direction of the workers and the duties as pastors, evangelists, and executives. Only in those matters requiring extensive business experience, administrative ability, and the disposition of large sums of money, do they retain control.

Possibly the pessimism of some missionaries regarding the development of native leadership has its origin in the fact that they have wanted native leaders to do just what they have done. To be a real leader one must have opportunity for self-expression and some originality. If the broader program can be generally adopted, native leadership may develop in a number of different lines. One would hazard the opinion that among Indian men and boys native leadership would quickly develop in the field of athletic sports, and among women and girls in the field of native arts and sewing. Every native leader in any field is a real achievement, and an achievement made in the course of the ministry to temporal needs may prove also to be an achievement in the conversion of the race to Christianity.