resultingly poor farm, and a poor dairy herd. Here the per capita was woefully inadequate and its inadequacy handicapped the efforts of the superintendent and the principal to bring the plant back to efficiency. A boarding school on a neighboring reservation in the same state had an excellent irrigation plant, a remarkable farm, and an outstanding dairyman. The children had an abundance of milk, plenty of butter, loads of fresh vegetables, good home grown meat, and almost a gallon of honey per pupil per year. Sales from the farm added to its income. It was a pleasure to see these Indian children eat, effectively refuting the argument that Indian children will not drink milk and eat butter and that you can't get them to like vegetables. Each of the two schools, however, had substantially the same per capita. Either Congress itself should give more consideration to the needs of each individual school or it should delegate this authority to the Indian Office subject to suitable accounting control.

Conferences of Employees. This recommendation for a committee on rules, regulations, and procedure should be accompanied by one for the wider use and fuller development of local conferences for superintendents, other agency employees, supervisory officers from the Washington office, and members of the suggested Division of Planning and Development. The annual conference of the superintendents of the Navajo jurisdictions indicates the possibilities in this direction. It is beneficial for the superintendents and other employees to get together to discuss their problems and for the Washington officers to participate with them. Provisions should be made so that persons not in the Indian Service, specially qualified to discuss the problems the superintendents face, may attend these conferences, speak, and participate in the discussions. The superintendents and the other field employees should not be asked to keep their noses always to the grindstone; they need now and then to get and possibly to give a new vision of their work. Such labor in itself affords in a way a little rest and relaxation and is a legitimate government expense. On rare occasions a national convention of Indian workers might return many times its cost, especially if it were divided into sections for the discussion of concrete problems and if the missionary bodies and other interested organizations would cooperate fully, as there is every reason to believe they would.

CHAPTER VI
PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION

In few if any of the larger organizations of the national government is the problem of personnel more difficult or more important than in the Indian Service.

The inherent difficulties lie in the diversity of the positions to be filled; the remoteness and isolation of many of the stations, not only rendering them unattractive to persons desiring normal social contacts but also resulting in the existence of many positions which cannot be closely supervised or directed; the unusual importance of those two factors so hard to measure in civil service procedure, character, and personality; and the obstacles in working with a more or less primitive people of another race having different culture and speaking a different language. These are handicaps enough without adding to them administratively.

A Low Salary Scale. The overwhelming administrative difficulty has arisen from the effort to operate the Service upon an exceptionally low salary scale. In order to fill positions, when the salary scale is low, resort is almost invariably taken to the device of low entrance qualifications. The law of supply and demand operates in hiring employees as it does in any other economic field. If one is not willing to pay the prevailing market rates for goods of standard quality, one must, as a rule, take seconds or an inferior grade. By lowering specifications and standards it is generally possible to get goods at a low price. Not infrequently more competition can be secured for supplying sub-standard articles than for furnishing goods of standard quality. This condition exists in the market for services. By lowering standards, the number of eligibles can ordinarily be greatly increased. To this device the Indian Service has had to resort in order to operate on its existing salary scale.¹

¹ Some improvement in the Indian Service was brought about by the so-called reclassification and salary standardization of the field services of the government made in the fiscal year 1925; but apparently the conditions were
The Need for Classification and Rigid Qualifications. The first need of the Indian Service in personnel administration is a thorough-going classification of positions on the basis of duties, responsibilities, and qualifications, with especial emphasis on qualifications requisite for recognized responsibilities. As has already been pointed out, the qualifications should be materially raised for those positions which involve direct contact with the Indians. No marked improvement in the service can ever be expected unless this is done.

When the qualifications have been established, they should be adhered to with unusual strictness both in original appointments and in promotion. This course may result in some apparent individual hardship on persons now in service who entered under the old conditions but the Service does not exist for them. Insofar as possible they should be given opportunity to qualify themselves for retention and for advancement or transfer to positions in other branches of the government which do not call for the technical qualifications they lack. But they should not be long retained in the Indian Service if not qualified to render the highest type of service under a sound plan of organization.

Indian Employees. Here a few words should be said regarding the policy of preferring Indians for appointment in the Indian Service. This policy is excellent provided the Indians possess the requisite qualifications, and every effort should be made to give them, or enable them to get, the training and experience essential. The policy is extremely unwise when it is given effect by lowering standards. Teaching positions in Indian schools are created for the purpose of educating Indian children. They exist for the Indian children and not to furnish teaching positions for Indian girls where training and experience would not enable them to qualify for the positions in other schools. Little evidence exists to indicate that the fact that they are Indians gives them any special advantage that offsets their lack of standard training and experience. They are probably neither much better nor much worse than any other teacher would be who had no more training, except insofar as they are limited by the narrowness of their background and experience in life. The object of the Indian Service should be to equip Indian girls to meet reasonably high standards so that they can get positions either in Indian schools or in nearly any public schools. If they can qualify under the same standards which are established for white teachers then it is reasonable to give them preference in the Indian Service. They should not have a monopoly on Indian Service positions and be unable to qualify for positions outside.

When Indians fully qualified are secured the same conditions of employment should be applied to them as are applied to white employees in the same or similar classes of positions. It is a serious mistake to countenance marked differences. For example, certain reasonably permanent Indian employees are not included under the retirement system. No deductions are made from their salaries to aid in the support of the retirement system and no benefits are available for them as they grow old or incapacitated. Because of this omission some superintendents are placed in a distinctly embarrassing situation. One Indian has for many years been employed at a station remote from the agency. He is the only representative of the government there. He is said to have done excellent work in the past and apparently he is popular with the Indians in his vicinity. Advancing age is obviously impairing his efficiency. He gets about only with considerable difficulty, and is forced more and more to require Indians to come to him instead of going to them. The superintendent feels the need for a younger man; but if this faithful Indian employee is dismissed, he will be turned out of the government quarters he has occupied as a home
and will have little means of support. His Indian friends will be incensed, and without understanding all the minutiae of civil service status and the retirement system, will cite the case as showing discrimination against Indians. Under the same circumstances the white employees would be given a retirement allowance. Why does the government slight the Indian?

At another jurisdiction the director of the survey was asked by a stately old Indian chief of police for an opportunity to present a personal matter. Arrangements were made for an evening meeting. The old man brought a carefully preserved file of papers consisting mainly of letters which had been written him by army officers and civilian superintendents commending him for specially meritorious service. Some of them dated back to his service as a scout for the government when troops were in the country, and others related to his work in aiding in rounding up a band of outlaws. He was conscious of the fact that he was old, perhaps too old, for a chief of police, and he wanted a pension. Several superintendents have done excellent work in aiding the old scouts who worked with the troops in establishing their rights to military pensions, but it is often hard to get the necessary evidence. This old chief of police ought to be entitled to a civil retirement benefit, because of the length of his service as a civil employee.

In the matter of quarters, too, the effort should be made to prevent discrimination. Unquestionably white employees as a rule have come from homes which are physically superior to those from which Indian employees have come, yet the Indians are quick to note the sometimes marked difference between the accommodations furnished white employees and those furnished Indian employees, especially if tribal funds are used in support of the agency. It is probably true that the Indians on the reservations visit more frequently and more intimately the homes of the Indian employees. It is therefore highly desirable that these houses be in a sense models, not elaborate or ornate but examples of reasonable standards in housing, sanitation, and housekeeping. Several of the homes of Indian employees visited were in fact models insofar as the Indians could make them so with what the government supplied as a foundation. Most Indian employees would doubtless take care of what the government might supply in the way of improved accommodations. Those who did not could be "romped on," to borrow a pet expression from one superintendent who maintains standards on his reservation and at his boarding school by encouraging those who are doing good work and systematically "romping on" those who are slack.

Members of Family as Employees. The same principles regarding rigid qualifications should apply in hiring the husbands or the wives of Indian Service employees. If the wife of the doctor is a qualified trained nurse, it may be advisable to give her preference in appointment because of local housing conditions, but it is extremely unwise to make local housing conditions the deciding factor and to appoint a doctor’s wife to perform the duties of a hospital nurse despite lack of training. It may be convenient to appoint the wife of the engineer to a position as girls’ matron. The fact that both can be employed may help to offset the fact that each salary in itself is too low to maintain a family, but the wife may have none of the qualities really needed in the position of girls’ matron. Illustrations might be multiplied almost indefinitely, but the principle is obvious. Each position must be filled by a person qualified to fill it; relationship to another employee, like Indian blood, is a matter of secondary concern.

Importance of Character, Personality, and Ability to Get Along with Indians. In establishing the qualifications for entrance into the Service two highly important factors will have to be taken into consideration, despite the probable impossibility of establishing any formal civil service tests for them. They are: (1) Character and personality, and (2) ability to understand Indians and to get along with them.

The most practicable device for testing character and personality is through establishing a real probationary period and requiring a positively favorable report on these essential qualities before a probationary appointment is made permanent. The probationary period for persons in the Indian field service should probably be never less than one year\(^2\) and in cases where reasonable doubt as to adaptability exists it should be possible to extend it for at least

\(^2\)A probationary appointee can, of course, be dismissed at any time during the probationary period if found unsatisfactory. The question as to its duration relates solely to how long a time shall elapse before the person attains a permanent status.
another year. Permanent appointments should be made only when it is clear that the person possesses the character and the personality that fits him for the Indian Service.

Ability to understand Indians and to get along with them should be tested by some deliberately planned vestibule training, where the new employee can work under supervision and direction. He should have the opportunity to show that he has sympathy and understanding and to secure the advice and suggestions of older heads who have been particularly successful in their contacts with the Indians. It is a serious mistake to send a new and untried teacher, unfamiliar with Indians, drawn through a written examination, sight unseen, to a remote day school in the southwestern desert, miles away from the agency and from the nearest white neighbor. There he personifies the white race and the government of the United States. It is not fair to him and his young wife; it is not fair to the Indians. The surprising thing is not that there are failures but that there are some successes. Persons should not be detailed to isolated stations until they have had some preliminary training in the Indian Service.

Salaries Should Be Raised. Salaries obviously must be sufficient to get reasonable competition from persons possessed of the required qualifications and the range of salaries must be such that successful employees may be advanced in pay without being transferred to a different locality. The survey staff holds no brief for high entrance salaries. It would have them only as high as is necessary to attract qualified persons, which means about what other organizations are offering as entrance salaries for like positions. Placing them any higher would tend to make probationers who do not really fit the Indian Service try by every means to hold on. The staff, however, specifically advocate reasonable opportunity for, and certainty of advancement for, persons who have demonstrated their fitness for their work. The school farmer who has made an outstanding success of the farm, the stockman who has made an outstanding success of his tribal herd ought to be kept and rewarded. If their pay is not materially increased, they are likely to go into business for themselves or accept offers from private companies, generally on the lookout for men who have demonstrated their ability. In the absence of opportunity for advancement the Service is likely to lose its best. Material increases in the range of salary are therefore recommended with reasonable certainty of advancement for competent employees.1

The annual turnover in the Indian Service amounts to approximately 1200 a year, or between 20 and 25 per cent. Resignations frequently result in temporary appointments to fill vacancies and not infrequently the person available for temporary service does not possess the requisite qualifications for the position. Yet this person may serve in it for a very considerable period because of the difficulty of securing one with the qualifications. This situation is serious in positions requiring technical or professional qualifications, and in these positions the turnover is especially high.4

Conditions of Employment. The question of conditions of employment at schools and reservations is almost as important as that of salary and in some instances may be even more so. One of the abler, more highly trained, Indian farmers complained, not because he had to support his wife and children on $1200 a year, but because his house had no running water and no bath. It was hard to keep the children clean enough for school when the thermometer was below zero and all the water had to be brought in from the pump back of the house and heated on the kitchen stove. He took a very pardonable pride in the fact that his children looked as spick and span as any of those in the public school visited, and he confided

1 The government might well give serious consideration to the possibility of making special cash allowances to employees on remote reservations who have children fitted for high school and are not within practicable reach of any local high school. Parents who find themselves in this position are likely first to seek transfer to another jurisdiction where schools are available, and the Service under existing conditions must look with favor on such requests, although the employee may be doing excellent work where he is and be much needed there. To move him may be to set the Indians back. If the Office insists on his remaining he is likely to look for other employment in a place where he can send his children to public school without expense for tuition and board and lodging. One superintendent visited was confronting this problem. An offer of a commercial position in an urban community at a somewhat smaller salary to start with seemed from the standpoint of family life and family budget to be far more attractive. The general level of salaries cannot, of course, be fixed high enough so that all officers and employees could if they chose send their children away to secondary schools instead of patronizing local high schools, but where free local high schools are not within reach some special allowance might well be made.

4 For the situation with respect to nurses, see pages 242 to 251.
that this was the first job he had ever had where he and his family did not have access to a bath tub at least once a week. Although on one occasion it was already almost eight o'clock at night and he had had nothing to eat since noon, had been driving members of the survey staff steadily since early morning with the thermometer well below zero and was then thirty miles from home, he was reluctant to accept an invitation to dinner with the staff until someone had the inspiration to say, “I'll let you have a crack at my bath room in the hotel.” That settled the matter. To a certain type of employee, considerate of his wife and children, conditions of the home and access to schools mean even more than wages.

Deduction for Quarters. Attention should here be called to a situation which developed in connection with the use of the Classification Act for the District of Columbia as an ostensible standard for the field services. As very few employees in the District of Columbia received allowances of quarters and meals, the salary schedules for the District provided only cash salaries and the act required the Personnel Classification Board to “make necessary adjustments in compensation for positions carrying maintenance.” Later the Comptroller General ruled that this clause required deductions to be made from the salaries of the Indian Service employees who were receiving allowances. The emergency was met, in a mechanical sort of fashion, by adding an arbitrary fairly uniform value of quarters to the cash pay to get a new gross pay and then deducting it again for value of quarters leaving the employees where they were before, except that the percentage deduction for the retirement allowances was figured on the new gross pay, thus making the deductions a trifle larger.

Knowing all the facts, one can sympathize with the reservation superintendent who took vigorous exception when a member of the survey staff asked a school dormitory matron whether fifteen dollars a month was deducted from her salary for the privilege of occupying the tiny room where she spent the night so as to be immediately available in case of the least demand upon her services. To him it seemed as if nothing but praise was due the Indian Office for its success in meeting the emergency in a way that resulted in no loss to the employees. He could not understand the point of view that consideration should be given to the actual value of the quarters and to the service required in connection with their occupancy.

The fact is, of course, that there is wide variation in the value of the quarters and other allowances furnished the same class of employees in the different jurisdictions. If the gross salaries are the same and the deductions for quarters and allowances uniform, without reference to their real value, one employee obviously gets more than another, and this difference is not based on their efficiency or their merits. It would seem that the gross salary scale should be uniform and that the deductions for allowances should take into consideration both their value and the extra service which must be rendered in connection with the occupancy of quarters.

To arrive at the value of quarters and other allowances would of course require a thorough-going study of all employees' quarters, probably through the use of a carefully drafted schedule similar to those used in housing studies. Such a schedule could be filled in by the employee, checked and reviewed by the school or reservation superintendent, and submitted to the Washington office for uniform consideration. These reports would not only serve as a basis for a fair evaluation of allowances but as a device for locating those which are below a reasonable standard and bringing them up. It is unquestionably true that superintendents differ very much with respect to where they put their emphasis in recommending appropriations or allotments for their reservations or schools. Some give serious consideration to the upkeep and improvement of all buildings, including employees' quarters; others are interested in a single new big building project, such as a dormitory, gymnasium, or dining hall; still others are apparently little concerned with physical equipment. The result is fairly wide variation. Studies of employees' quarters, dormitory facilities, and so on, directed from the central office, would improve this situation.

Extra Duties in Connection with Quarters. In those cases where quarters are located in dormitories, hospitals or other similar places and the occupants are subject to night duty, it hardly seems as if any deduction should be made for quarters. Anyone who has spent several nights in an Indian school dormitory, not in a quiet guest room but in an employee's room near the main sleeping halls, learns that it is not the same as a room in the employees' quarters.
it is pointed out that the long full day does not give the children opportunity for individual effort in things of particular personal interest or experience in the use and direction of leisure time, and in some instances is detrimental to health. The point to be brought out here is that the long day makes great demands on the employees, leaving them little time for their own recreation. Several teachers miss particularly the opportunity for reading and studying which is at once recreation and the means of improving their work. The fact is, of course, appreciated that in Indian boarding schools the teachers cannot possibly have the opportunity for study and recreation that is enjoyed by public school teachers, both in city and rural systems, yet the question must be raised as to whether by careful consideration the existing conditions could not be materially improved.

Vacations. Special emphasis should be placed on the importance of seeing that all field employees have full, unrestricted opportunity to take their annual leave and to get away from their stations, particularly when their posts are isolated. At times, of course, the observance of this principle will improve embarrassing and the valuable conscientious employee will stick by the ship unless provision is made for him to go and he is urged to do so. Deliberate plans for leave should be made and a schedule worked out. If the plan of having the employees own their own cars and paying them mileage for their use on official business could be worked out, it would materially help many employees and their families to have the means of getting a real vacation. Many of the employees who already own personal cars have bought them primarily because they make possible real vacations in the western country, an ideal place for trips if one has a car.

Conferences of Employees. Mention should again be made of the desirability of more conferences of employees. Gatherings of the employees of a given class from all the jurisdictions within a reasonable radius would combine rest and recreation with development and renewed interest in the work. In some years it would doubtless prove helpful to have all the Indian teachers come together for a special summer institute at one of the larger boarding

---

4 See pages 151 to 153.
schools instead of going to regular schools and colleges for their educational leave, especially if a strong program could be worked out giving them contacts not only with other teachers in the Indian Service but also with specialists from colleges, universities, or private organizations who can present modern educational problems in order that they may be adapted to and incorporated in the Indian Service.

Removals from the Service. Removals from the service should be less restricted by making the exits wider, a matter already discussed in connection with organization and general administration. This is to be achieved through reducing the retirement age and making the retirement allowance more adequate; increasing the length of the probationary period and requiring positive evidence and reports of fitness in training, experience, character, and personality before a probationary period is ended by permanent appointment; and a much less frequent use of transfers when employees are unsatisfactory in the jurisdiction to which they are assigned.

The Indians themselves and the employees doing real work for the Indians should be protected from four types of employees: (1) The employee who has himself reached the conclusion that nothing can be done for the Indian and that it is useless to try; (2) the employee who has acquired a manner toward the Indians that outrages their self respect and turns them against the government and all its representatives; (3) the hard-boiled disciplinarian who persists after having been shown better methods in following a course that turns the Indian away from the schools, making them quit before they have finished and sending them back to their homes to advise others against attending; and (4) the employee who has lost active interest and is marking time.

In visiting one school it was found that a certain employee followed disciplinary methods which are now regarded as antiquated even in a reform school. Subsequently in visiting homes in the territory from which this school draws its pupils it was found that this employee's reputation had spread to the remote sections. The able young Indian employee who was guide and interpreter tried hard to persuade two Indian children who were living with the widowed father of one of them in a desperately poor shack on a barren hillside and who were almost entirely without education, although in their early teens, to go to this school. He presented well its advantages and their needs. They presented their objections, which were based primarily on the reputation of this particular employee.

Administrative Needs in Field of Personnel. Thus, to cite the principles which should govern in this field of personnel administration, so vital to the success of the Indian Service, is simple enough; and it is believed they will receive fairly ready acceptance in the abstract. The main question is how they are to be made administratively effective in a service containing approximately five thousand employees scattered to a degree scarcely equalled in any other branch of the government that approaches the Indian Service in its diversity of activities.

Need of Chief Personnel Officer. The primary need to make these principles administratively effective is to secure for the Indian Service a well trained, experienced chief personnel officer, who will devote all his time to the problems of personnel administration. His position should be classified in Grade 5 of the professional and scientific service with a salary from $5200 to $6000. He should have a liberal allowance for traveling expenses and for assistance, both clerical and technical. It is believed that about $15,000 would be required, in addition to what is now spent, for personnel records and employees to maintain them. It is difficult to think of any other way in which that amount could be spent that would do more in raising the level of the Indian Service, because it is a service in which personnel is the outstanding dominant factor.

The chief personnel officer would be a staff, not a line, officer. He would not directly administer anything except his own work and that of his immediate assistants. He would advise the Commissioner and the other chief administrators, both in the Washington office and in the field, in matters of general policy and procedure affecting personnel. In matters affecting individuals and particular situations his function would be to investigate and report, to recommend action, not to take action. Power to take action should be left in the administrative line. The function of this officer should be solely to give expert advice and the results of investigations made by a real specialist, not himself, directly involved in the administrative action which is being investigated.

His duties, briefly stated, would be somewhat as follows: 1. To know the duties and responsibilities of all the positions in the Indian Service and the qualifications required for the adequate performance of those duties. In order to get this kno-
edge and to keep it current he will have to have knowledge of and experience in the field of the analysis and classification of positions, gained either in a government service or in a large private corporation having a well established personnel department.

2. To cooperate with the Civil Service Commission in preparing tests for entrance into those positions filled by open competition, in grading such tests as are given specially for the Indian Service, and in perfecting those civil service rules applicable to it.

3. To establish cooperative relationships with the sources of supply of properly trained persons so that suitable candidates will be induced to enter the competition.

4. To develop systems of vestibule training or probationary assignments so that new employees before assignment to isolated positions in direct contact with the Indians may have special training under adequate supervision, and so that the question as to their character, personality and missionary spirit may be tested and determined during the probationary period.

5. To maintain close cooperative relationships with superintendents of schools and agencies so that he may be constantly informed regarding the general needs of each agency with respect to personnel and the actual performance of each employee. In this connection he will advise in the matter of work records and efficiency records based on them.

6. To maintain an open door or open letter box so that employees may have an officer specifically designated to hear their troubles and ambitions and to investigate their complaints.

7. To maintain an open door or letter box so that Indians on the reservations, missionaries or members of the general public may file complaints regarding employees; and to receive the substance of complaints filed with other officers regarding employees.

8. To require positive evidence of fitness of new appointees before their probational appointment is made permanent and to arrange with the Civil Service Commission for suitable probationary periods and for their extensions so that the probationary period is made a genuine part of the entrance test.

9. To pass upon all requests and recommendations for the promotion of transfer of employees.

10. To make recommendations to the Commissioner for the transfer, retirement or dismissal of employees.

11. To make recommendations to the Commissioner for improving the conditions of work, including allowances, hours, and leave.

12. To initiate movements for conferences of employees so that the general tone of the Service may be raised.

13. To assist the Commissioner in presenting to the Personnel Classification Board data relating to the classification of positions in the Indian Service.

14. To assist the Commissioner in presenting to the Budget Bureau and to the Committees of Congress data regarding the needs of the Service in respect to personnel, the salary levels for the several classes of positions, and the conditions of work.

This summary statement of duties indicates that the recommended position of chief personnel officer is one of great responsibility. The person selected should have not only technical training and experience in the field of personnel administration but also a judicial temperament, sound judgment, a good personality, and great capacity for hard work. He should be given at least one well qualified technical assistant, so that as a rule one or the other can always be in the Washington office, immediately available to the Commissioner. The other should generally be in the field, visiting schools and agencies. Rarely should a year pass without at least one visit to each jurisdiction from the chief personnel officer or his technically trained assistant, so that they may be intimately acquainted with the field. Experience may demonstrate that two assistants instead of one are necessary to cover the immense territory adequately, but at the outset it would be wise to attempt the work with one. Every effort should be made to resist the temptation to make them responsible for actual administration or to have them make investigations or reports outside the field of personnel. Investigations and reports on the actual administration of particular activities, such as education, agriculture, or home demonstration work should be made by specialists in these fields. The utmost cooperation should prevail between the chief personnel officer and the other officers, both line and staff, because of their common interests.