

### GRAND TRAVERSE BAND OF OTTAWA AND CHIPPEWA INDIANS TRIBAL APPELLATE COURT

2605 N. West Bay Shore Drive, Peshawbestown, MI 49682 (231)-534-7050, Main \*\* (231)-534-7051, Fax \*\* tribalcourt@gtb-nsn.gov

GRAND TRAVERSE BAND
OF OTTAWA AND
CHIPPEWA INDIANS
TRIBAL COURT
TRIBAL COURT OF
APPEALS

# OPINION AFTER ORAL ARGUMENT

CASE NO. 2023-38-AP (Lower Case # 2023-3398-CV-EV)

Court Address Email Telephone No. Fax No. 2605 N. West Bay Shore Dr., Peshawbestown, MI 49682 (231) 534-7050 tribalcourt@gtb-nsn.gov (231) 534-7051 Appellant Name, Mailing Address and Phone Appellee Name, Mailing Address and Phone Stephanie Perrault GTB Housing 2655 Beems- Kwa-Mah Mi Kun 2605 N. West Bayshore Dr. ٧. Peshawbestown, MI 49682 Peshawbestown, MI 49682 Attorney's Mailing Address, Phone, Email Attorney's Mailing Address, Phone, Email In Pro Per GTB Legal Department John Petoskey (P41499) 2605 N. West Bayshore Dr. Peshawbestown, MI 49682 (231) 534-7978

#### **Opinion after Oral Argument**

On July 5, 2023, the Grand Traverse Band trial court granted judgment to the Grand Traverse Band Housing Department ("GTB Housing") over Stephanie Perrault. GTB Housing sought eviction of Ms. Perrault from 2655 Beems-Kawa-Mah Mi-Kun, Peshawbestown, MI. The trial court gave Ms. Perrault 30 days to vacate the premises. The trial court further awarded GTB Housing \$2,401.52.

On August 3, 2023, Ms. Perrault filed an appeal. On August 5, 2023, the trial court granted a stay on the judgment pending appeal. Ms. Perrault did not file an opening brief. On December 12, 2023, GTB Housing filed a brief.

This court held oral argument on December 13, 2023. After review of the record and the arguments of the parties, we AFFIRM.

### GRAND TRAVERSE BAND OF OTTAWA AND CHIPPEWA INDIANS TRIBAL APPELLATE COURT

2605 N. West Bay Shore Drive, Peshawbestown, MI 49682 (231)-534-7050, Main \*\* (231)-534-7051, Fax \*\* tribalcourt@gtb-nsn.gov

#### Standard of Review

GTB Court Rule 9.401 dictates the standard of review for appeals. This court must sustain trial court findings of fact unless the finding was clearly erroneous. GTB Court Rule 9.401(A). This court does not have to defer to trial court conclusions of law, however, and reviews those conclusions *de novo*. GTB Court Rule 9.401(E).

#### Discussion

We affirm the trial court judgment because there is nothing in the record and no argument presented to us that rises to a sustainable challenge to the judgment.

The trial court sustained the allegations made by GTB Housing, allegations that were proven by the tribe's submission of evidence below. Ms. Perrault effectively conceded at trial and throughout this appeal conceded that she has not paid rent for a long time. There is no indication that the trial court's findings of fact were clearly erroneous.

The primary argument made by Ms. Perrault both in the notice of appeal and during oral argument is that Ms. Perrault hopes to gather adequate resources to repay the housing department. Ms. Perrault offered no evidence that this was so, and even if she had, the time for repaying the housing department had long run out. There is no argument presented that the trial court incorrectly interpreted and applied the law.

Like the tribe, we are empathetic and sympathetic to Ms. Perrault's plight, but there is nothing in the law that allows this court to do anything but affirm the judgment.

Date: 1 11 2024

Hon. Matthew L.M. Fletcher

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> We note subsection (A) is labeled "Judge Finding of Fact," but the text of the rule references findings of fact "by a jury." Subsection (B) is labeled "Jury Finding of Fact," with the text of that rule again referencing findings of fact "by a jury." We assume for purposes of this appeal that subsection (A) involves judicial findings of fact.

## GRAND TRAVERSE BAND OF OTTAWA AND CHIPPEWA INDIANS TRIBAL APPELLATE COURT

2605 N. West Bay Shore Drive, Peshawbestown, MI 49682 (231)-534-7050, Main \*\* (231)-534-7051, Fax \*\* tribalcourt@gtb-nsn.gov

On 1310 Do 12100 On 5 1310				2000 V 100	was and a	
GRAND TRAVERSE BAND				CASE NO.		
		OF OF SERVICE		2023-38-AP		
CHIPPEWA INDIANS				(Lower Case #		
TRIBAL COURT				2023-339	98-CV-EV)	
TRIBAL COURT OF				100100000000000000000000000000000000000		
APPEALS						
Court Address 2605 N. West Bay Shore Dr., Peshawbestown, MI	Email	nail         Telephone No.         Fax No.           balcourt@gtb-nsn.gov         (231) 534-7050         (231) 534-7051				
Appellant Name, Mailing Address and Phone		Appellee Name, Mailing Address and Phone				
		AND ALL AND PRODUCED CONTROL OF C				
Stephanie Perrault	37	GTB Housing				
2655 Beems- Kwa-Mah Mi Kun	V.	2605 N. West Bayshore Dr.				
Peshawbestown, MI 49682			Peshawbestown, MI 49682			
Attorney's Mailing Address, Phone, Email	3	Attorney's Maili	ailing Address, Phone, Email			
In Pro Per		CTD I I D				
III FIO FEI		GTB Legal Department				
		John Petoskey (P41499) 2605 N. West Bayshore Dr.				
		Peshawbestown, MI 49682				
		(231) 534-7978				
		(251) 554-7978				
PROOF OF SERVICE  I, Lauren Parzych, being duly sworn, deposes and states that on the date below I sent by:						
☐ first class mail ☐ inter-office mail ☐ log book ☐ other:		email	fax	personal service/hand delivered		
the documents listed below to the individuals identified below by placing a copy of the same with the United States Postal Service in Suttons Bay Michigan and/or as indicated below (see Method of Service).						
Documents enclosed: Opinion after Oral Argument						
Served To: Me Court File Ori		Method of Service: Original 1655 Beems-Kwa-Ma Mi-Kun, Peshawbestown, MI 49682				
GTB Housing Inter-Office Mail				n, r csnawocstown,	1011 47002	
GTB Legal Department Email			riun			
Judge JoAnne Cook Email and Address on Fil			ldress on File			
Judge Matthew Fletcher Email and Address on File						
			ail and Address on File			
I declare the statements above are true	to the best o	of my infor	mation, knowled	lge, and belief.		
Date: 1 14 2024						
Lauren Parzych, Clerk of the Court						